





Feedback Report CACAO BEAN SAMPLE CODE 000/23

Submitted for the 2023 Edition of the Cacao of Excellence Awards

08 February, 2024

DATE OF REPOR

Origin X

Producer X PRODUCER

Region X



CONTACT: Julien Simonis Programme Manager of Cacao of Excellence

For more information: cacaoofexcellence.org



https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/ © Bioversity International 2023

Origin: Region:



Background

Cacao of Excellence is a neutral global platform that brings together the public and private sector to discover, promote, and reward cacao producers across origins for their superior quality and flavour diverse cacao. Since 2009, the platform has held the prestigious global Cacao of Excellence Awards, celebrating the expertise of producers and showcasing the diversity of exceptional cacao worldwide. Cacao of Excellence's vision is to drive the expansion of superior quality cacao, improving the livelihoods of cacao producers, and safeguarding cacao biodiversity for the benefit of farmers, consumers and the planet.

Cacao of Excellence is led by the Alliance of Bioversity International and the International Center for Tropical Agriculture (CIAT), part of the CGIAR global partnership uniting international organisations engaged in agricultural innovation. Cacao of Excellence is organised in partnership with the International Cocoa Organization (ICCO), Guittard Chocolate, Seguine Cacao, Cocoa and Chocolate Advisors, the USDA project Maximising Opportunities for Cacao and Coffee in Latin America (MOCCA), Barry Callebaut, Cacao Barry, the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation, Salon du Chocolat, Puratos-Belcolade, the Cocoa Research Centre of the University of the West Indies (CRC/UWI), Valrhona, Regis Bouet, Fairtrade International, TreeGether, NGSER, Universidad Nacional Agraria La Molina Peru, the Cocoa Research Institute of Ghana (CRIG), the Zurich University of Applied Sciences (ZHAW), CATIE, Tcho, Cocoatown, Herencia, LADY AGRI, Organizzazione internazionale italo-latino americana (IILA), OFI, Universidad del Valle de Guatemala, Chocolatier CAS, Cacao Crudo, Binder, fkv, Eurochocolate and the Umbria Chamber of Commerce.

Cocoa producers of all origins were invited to submit 5kg samples of well-prepared, fermented and dried cacao beans representing the genetic and geographic origins of their regions, through their respective National Organization Committees (NOCs) by 31 January 2023, following the guidelines for participation. For this 2023 Edition of the Cacao of Excellence Awards we are pleased to note that all samples submitted were processed directly in the new Cacao of Excellence Laboratory in Rome, Italy from bean to bar! In addition, during the processing and evaluation of samples, the new Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, published September 2023, is a valuable reference as noted in the Annex.

For the 2023 Edition, **52 cacao producing origins** participated. All **222 cacao bean samples received** were assigned a blind code on reception and evaluated for physical and whole and cut bean sensory qualities. Of these, **218 accepted cacao bean samples** were processed into cacao mass and evaluated blindly by the **11 members of the** <u>Cacao of Excellence Technical Committee</u>, a panel of international sensory evaluation experts. Based on the cacao mass evaluation, the **Best 50 superior quality cacao samples** were **selected**, representing the four cacao-producing regions. These samples were subsequently processed into a dark chocolate using an identical recipe for each, tempered and moulded. These Best 50 chocolate samples were then evaluated blindly by a panel **of 32 cacao and chocolate professionals.** In all, **18 Gold**, **16 Silver**, **and 18 Bronze** award winners were announced and celebrated 08 February, 2024 at the 2023 Cacao of Excellence Awards Ceremony held in Amsterdam, Netherlands at the Chocoa Trade Fair and Chocolate Makers' Forum during Amsterdam Cocoa Week.

Purpose

This report provides feedback to all participating cacao bean producers about the quality of the sample submitted. Providing individual feedback is a critical part of the Cacao of Excellence Awards as it provides producers with a unique opportunity to understand in detail the results of the evaluation of their sample and improve quality for future production.



I. Producer information

A. Producer - Contact det	ails
Official producer name	
Type of producer	Individual producer of the sample
Contact person	
Phone of contact person	
E-mail of contact person	
Location of the farm	
Address	
Town	
District	
Region	
Country	
GPS coordinates	
B. Sender of the sample t	o Cacao of Excellence – Contact details
Name	
Organisation	
Phone	
E-mail	
	Cacao of Excellence R&D Laboratory, Rome, Italy
Date of reception	01/02/2023
C. National Organization	Committee (NOC)

Contact details of the National Organization Committee



II. Information on the cacao bean sample as provided by the producer

A. Description of the farm and agricultural practices

Size of the farm (ha)	1.0
Plot(s) number on the farm represented by the sample (if relevant)	Plot 1
Productivity (Kg dried beans/ha/year)	100
Type of farming practices	Agroforestry system

B. Genetic origin and sample type

Weight of sample sent (g) Dominating genetic origin Local name of cacao variety Type of sample (commercial / experimental) If commercial, estimated production volume in coming years (tonnes/year)

5000 Forastero Local Forastero

Commercial

1.0





C. Fermentation method

Date	01/11/2022
Duration (days)	7
Traditional method used	Yes
Container type	Wooden boxes
First turn	3 days after start of fermentation
Total number of turns	3
Total weight of fermentation mass (kg)	50

D. Drying method

	Date	01/12/2022
	Duration (days)	7
	Traditional method(s) used	Yes
	Specific type	Direct: Wood
	Thickness of the drying bean layer (cm)	3.0
E.	Storage conditions	
	Temperature (°C)	20
	Relative Humidity (%)	50

Pest control during storage Yes





III. Physical quality evaluation results

Α.	Whole unroasted beans						
	External bean aroma		Desc	cription of aroma of wh	ole beans		
	External bean appearance		Desc	Description of appearance of whole beans			
	Bean count (/100g) — see Annex 1 Note 1		100	(Standard Beans)			
	Average weight per bean (g)		1.0				
	Cleaning loss (%) – see Anne	x1Note 2	1.0				
	Moisture content (%) – see Anne	x 1 Note 3	7.0	(Optimal Moisture)			
	Cut have and America Note	4					
В.	Cut beans – see Annex T Note	4					
	Link to cut test photos	SharePoir	nt link j	provided by Cacao of I	Excellence		
	Cut test aroma	Descriptic	on of cu	ut beans aroma			
	Cut test appearance	Descriptic	on of cu	ut beans appearance			
	% purple / violet	15		% light brown	15	% mouldy	0
	% partly purple	15		% medium brown	25	% slaty	0
	% white / ivory / yellowish	10		% dark brown	20	% internally infested	0
C.	Internal bean fissuring – see	Annex 1 M	Note 5	ō			
	Fissuring grade 1 (%)	25		Fissuring gr	ade 3 (%)	25	
	Fissuring grade 2 (%)	25		Fissuring gr	ade 4 (%)	25	
D.	Roasting conditions for proce	ssing int	to cad	cao mass – see An	nex 1 Note	e 6 and Note 7	
	Temperatur	e (°C) 12	0				
	Time (min	utes) 25	5				
	Nibs' yield (%) – see Annex 1 N	lote 8 75	5.0				
Ε.	Cacao mass characteristics						
(Cacao butter content in cacao mass ((%) _{FOO}					
	– see Annex 1 Not	e 9 50.0	+/- 0	0.5			
	Cacao mass fineness (µ	. m) 15					



IV. Cacao mass flavour sensory evaluation

For information on the cacao mass evaluation process see Annex 1 Note 10



Attivate	ney sub attribute
Attribute1	Sub-attribute1
Attribute2	Sub-attribute2
Attribute3	Sub-attribute3
Attribute4	Sub-attribute4

D. Comments on flavour

Comments on cacao mass from the members of the Technical Committee

E. Comments on post-harvest

Comments / recommendations from the members of the Technical Committee



V. Chocolate flavour sensory evaluation

For more information on the chocolate evaluation process see Annex 1 Note 11





VI. Cacao of Excellence 2023 Award



This cacao bean sample, CoEx Code 000/23 received the award: Cacao of Excellence Gold 2023

during the Awards Ceremony,

on 08 February 2024.

For further information about the Award Ceremony on 08 February 2024, consult the website: <u>cacaoofexcellence.org</u>



Annex 1. Notes

- 1. Bean size classifications according to bean count ranges as defined by ISO 2451:2017: Standard beans (<100), medium beans (101–110), small beans (111–120), and very small beans (>120).
- 2. Cleaning loss is the total loss in the bean sample mass from the removal of small (sieving) and big (such as stones, screws, flat beans, bean clusters) particles. Detailed procedure on determining the cleaning loss can be found in the Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, Section 8.4.1 "Determining the cleaning loss," which is available on the website: Cacao of Excellence Cacao Guide.
- 3. Moisture was measured using the Dickey-John mini-GAC plus moisture meter, and the 121003 Cacao Bean (6-23%) calibration. The optimal range (medium level) of moisture content is 6.5–7.5%; below 6% (low level), bean breakage is high, and above 8% (high level), the risk of mould growth is high (Sukha DA, 2017). Detailed procedure on determining the moisture content can be found in the Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, Chapter 7 "Determination of moisture content," which is available on the website: Cacao of Excellence Cacao Guide.
- 4. Cut test is a method used to assess bean quality based on visual observations (colour, internal fissuring, and presence of defects) and odour (aroma of cut beans). Judgement is required in interpreting cut tests: it is incorrect to assume that a cut test below a minimum of "X%" fully fermented beans (brown beans) indicates the fermentation is not done correctly. The cut test criterion is first established by observing the flavour profile, then identifying the cut profile associated with the desired resulting flavour of the beans. It is an indicative reference only and not a predictive criterion. The cacao cut test chart (Annex 3) was used as reference for evaluating the cut beans. A Magra 14 guillotine cutter from Teserba was used for the cut tests. Detailed procedure on how to carry the cut test can be found in the Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, Chapter 9 "Physical evaluation of cut cacao beans," which is available on the website: Cacao of Excellence Cacao Guide.
- 5. Internal bean fissuring is a published alternative view of the fermentation of the beans. Publications have been in a series of US patents linking fissuring to cacao flavanol content. Internal Bean Fissuring US Patent 6582747B2, June 24, 2003 is presented in Annex 3.
- 6. Roasting was performed in a Binder FD56 forced draft convection oven, equilibrated to target temperature. Beans (800g) placed on two wire mesh-lined trays (0.6-cm mesh, 85%+ open area) were roasted one layer deep following the procedure described in the Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, Chapter 11 "Roasting cacao beans," which is available on the website: Cacao of Excellence Cacao Guide.
- 7. Roasting conditions: The basic roasting conditions selected were based on both the information provided by the sample submitter on the genetic background, combined with information from the cut test and physical quality analysis (appearance, fissuring, and aroma of the cut beans, moisture content and bean size). Information on bean moisture content and bean count were used to adjust the basic roasting conditions initially identified. Detailed procedure on how to select the roasting conditions can be found in the Guide for the Assessment of Cacao Quality and Flavour, Section 11.4.1 "Selecting the roasting conditions," which is available on the website: Cacao of Excellence Cacao Guide.
- 8. Yield measures the conversion of raw, cleaned beans to picked over, shell-free nibs. Following roasting, beans were cracked and winnowed. Following winnowing, nibs were hand picked to remove the last of the shell, both free shell and stuck (to a piece of nib) shell. This yields a very pure stream of nibs for maximum flavour expression. The yield is the percentage of nib weight / bean weight x 100.
- 9. Cacao butter content in cacao mass was measured using Modified AOAC 963.15: without hydrolysis and using hexane instead of ether.
- 10. Cacao mass sensory evaluation was carried out by the 11 members of the Cacao of Excellence Technical Committee on all accepted bean samples. The Glossary of Terms for Cacao Bean Flavour Evaluation as Cacao Mass and Chocolate (Annex 2), forms and guidelines are available here: <u>cacaoofexcellence.org/info-resources</u>. The Cacao of Excellence Technical Committee members information is available here: <u>Cacao of Excellence Technical Committee</u>.
- 11. Chocolate sensory evaluation was carried out by the Cacao of Excellence Technical Committee and a large panel of professionals on the best 50 cacao bean samples processed into chocolate. All resources used by this jury for their evaluations are available here: cacaoofexcellence.org/info-resources.



Annex 2. Cacao of Excellence Glossary of Terms

Attribute intensity scale and meanings:				
Inte	nsity	Meaning		
0 1 2 3 to 5 6 to 8 9 to 10 The flavour attribute		Absent. Just a trace and may not be found if tasted a Present in the sample but at low intensity. Clearly characterising the sample. Dominant characterisation of the sample. Maximum. Strong intensity. Overpowers som	gain. e other flav expected to	our notes in the sample. be present in every sample and scored.
2. Complementar	y attribı	Ites: characteristics that may or may not be perc	eived in cac	ao samples.
3. Off-flavours: re: Descriptor	Sulting for	rom defects that may or may not be perceived in cription	cacao samp	ity level / Reference notes
Cacao	Typica ferme	al flavour of roasted cacao beans that are well nted, dried, free of defects.	0–2	Under-fermented cacao, ancient Criollos.
			3–5	Appropriately fermented "Nacional" and Papua New Guinean lots.
			6–8	Appropriately fermented cacao, some West African and some Dominican Republic Hispaniolan lots.
			9–10	Some West African lots.
Acidity	Total acidit	acidity is the sum of the following individual ies. If the result is \geq 10 it is rounded to 10 as aximum:	0–2	Some well-prepared West African lots.
	• Frui	t: citric or other fruit acids.	3–5	Some Ecuadorian, Peruvian and Central American lots.
	 Acetic: vinegar (can be smelled in the sample). Lactic: typically occurring in sour milk and yogurt Mineral and butyric: harsh metallic tasting 	6–8	Some Dominican Republic Hispaniola, Papua New Guinean and Malaysian lots.	
	(min Perce deper	eral) and rancid butter (butyric). eption of acidity intensity is particularly ident on the amount of sample in the mouth.		
Bitterness	Basic kola r	taste, typically perceived in caffeine, coffee, nut, some beers and grapefruit.	1–2	Some ancient Criollos.
	Perce deper	ption of bitterness intensity is particularly ndent on the amount of sample in the mouth.	3–5 6–8	Well-prepared West African lots. Severely under- and un-fermented cacao.



Descriptor	Description		Intensity	level / Reference note
Astringency	Astringency could be perceived in two ways:		1–2	Some ancient Criollos.
	• Sharp mouth-drying effect, sharp, perceived	Ň	3–5	Normal intensity for most ca
	between tongue and palate and /or at the back	E N	6 9	nonnannenský for most ca
	typical of raw nut skins and green banana skins.	S I T	9_10	-
	• Velvety sensation on the sides of mouth and	Y	5 10	
	tongue. Typical of tannins in some wines or beers.	T Y P	Sharp- mouth drying	Typical of under-fermen cacao.
	Perception of astringency intensity is particularly dependent on the amount of sample in the mouth.	Ē	Velvety	Typical of appropriat fermented "Nacional".
Fresh fruit	Total fresh fruit is composed of the following sub-attributes:		0–2	Many West African lots.
	• Berry: red or black currant, strawberry, raspberry, blackberry, acai berry.		3–5	Some Central and So American, well fermented
	Citrus: orange, lemon, lime, grapefruit or generic consistent of citrus like fruit		67	Madagassar some Control
	• Dark: cherry, plum		0-7	South American country I
	Yellow / orange / white flesh: apricot, peach, pear banana			some Papua New Guinean
	 Tropical: passion fruit, pineapple, mango or soursop. 			
Browned fruit	Total browned fruit is composed of the following sub-attributes:		0–2	Many West African lots.
	• Dried: dried apricot, banana, yellow raisin, fig that has undergone an un sulphured drying process.		3–5	Fully fermented Indonesian some Caribbean country I
	• Browned: dark raisin, dates, prunes.		C 0	Como Donus Nou Cuincon
	• Over ripe: No longer fresh and severely over-ripe fruit, turning brown inside and outside, as a step towards over-fermentation.		0-8	some Caribbean country l
Vegetal	Total vegetal is composed of the following		0–2	West African lots.
	sub-attributes:		2 5	Annuan siatalus faunan
	 Grassy / Green vegetal / herbal: 		3-5	"Nacional" and some Caribb
	» Grassy – freshly cut grass, young green leaves.			country lots.
	» Green vegetal – crushed mature leaves.		6–8	Some Caribbean country
	» Herbai – hay, straw or herbai / dried green, herbs like thyme and rosemary.			and some Peruvian lots.
	• Earthy / mushroom / moss / woodsy:			
	» Earthy – smell of dampness rising from soil after rain.			
	» Mushroom – smell of fresh mushrooms.			
	»Moss – damp moss often associated with earthiness.			
	» Woodsy – leaves and wood on a forest floor.			



Descriptor	Description	Inter	sity level / Reference notes
Floral	Total floral is composed of the following:	0–2	West African lots.
	 Orange blossom: orange blossom flavour. Flowers: jasmine, honeysuckle, rose, lilac, lilies, otc. 	3–5	Appropriately fermented "Nacional" and some Caribbean country lots.
	ett.	6–8	Some Caribbean country lots and some Peruvian lots.
Woody	Total woody is composed of the following sub-attributes:	0–2	-
	 Light wood: freshly cut cacao wood, white pine wood, maple wood, ice-cream/popsicle wooden stick. 	3–5	Some "Nacional" and many West African lots.
	 Dark wood: oak, walnut, teak, mahogany. Resin: pitch of pine or other resinous wood. 		
Spice	Total spice is composed of the following sub-attributes:	0–2	In most origins.
	 Spices: dried coconut, nutmeg, cinnamon, cloves, cacao mass, tonka, vanilla, black pepper. 	3–5	In some West African, Central and
	 Tobacco: dried tobacco leaves. Savoury/Umami: sodium glutamate, umami. 		South American and Caribbean country lots.
Nutty	Total nutty is composed of the following sub- attributes:	0–2	In most origins.
	 Nutty – nut flesh: the edible kernel of a light roasted nut – hazelnut, macadamia, pecan, walnut, cashew, almond, Brazil nut 	3–5	Some Central and South American
	 Nutty – nut skins: the flavour of lightly roasted nut skins – hazelnut, macadamia, pecan, walnut, cashew, almond, Brazil nut 		ancient Criollos.
Caramel / Panela	Aromas reminiscent of caramel, brown sugar and panela (unrefined cane sugar)	0–2	In most origins
		3–5	Some Central and South American and Caribbean countries' lots and ancient Criollos
Sweetness (only for chocolate)	Basic taste of white sugar solutions, typically perceived in foods like candies and desserts that contain sugar (or other sweeteners such as aspartame) and also naturally found in other foods like fruits.		

Origin: Region:



Descriptor	Description	Intensity level / Reference notes
Roast degree	A measure of the extent of the roasting the beans. Significant under or over roasting alters many of the attribute values.	2–3: Low roast
		4–6: Medium roast
		7: High roast
		8–10: Levels of burnt/over-roasted
Off-flavours	Total Off-Flavours is the sum of any unpleasant	0: Absent – clean, well fermented, dried
	characters from the following. If the result is ≥ 10 it is rounded to 10 as the maximum:	and stored cacao beans.
	 Dirty/dusty: not related to texture but to an off- flavour. 	1–2: Low intensity.
	• Musty: stale, damp, mildew, decaying.	3+: Clearly characterizing the sample as a defect
	• Mouldy: characteristic of mould growth.	
	• Meaty/animal/leather:	
	» Meaty – cured meat, ham, rendered fat.	
	» Animal — dirty animal / farmyard.	
	»Leather – used old leather.	
	• Over-fermented/rotten fruit: decomposing fruit.	
	• Putrid/manure:	
	» Putrid – wet decomposing vegetative matter.	
	» Manure – farmyard animal manure.	
	• Smoky: contamination from the smoke (any kind).	
	• Other off-flavours: rancid, diesel, oil fumes, petroleum, tar, paint, tyres, chemicals, burnt, etc.	
Global Quality	The Global Quality score reflects the overall impression of the:	Global Quality scores and meaning below
	 expressed flavour potential 	
	 uniqueness of the sample 	
	 balance of flavour and cleanliness of the finish 	
	It celebrates the expression of genetics and terroir diversity through the farmer's knowhow.	





2B. Meaning of the global quality scores for the sensory evaluation of cacao beans processed into mass and chocolate (Cacao of Excellence 2023)

	Off-flavours	Core attributes	Complementary attributes	Notes
0 1 2 3	Serious off-flavours clearly characterizing the sample as defective	Masked by off-flavours	Masked by off-flavours	Be as specific as possible on the type of off-flavours as this is valuable feedback to the producers Depending on the type, number and intensity of off-flavours,
				0 would be the worst case and 3 the least but still bad
4	In low intensity	Seriously unbalanced	Masked by off-flavours and unbalanced core attributes	
5	In low intensity	Unbalanced	Partially masked by unbalanced core attributes	
6	In low intensity or absent	Unbalanced	In low intensity, none outstanding, not in balance to core attributes	Overall plain flavour – mainly characterized by the core attributes and less by the complementary attributes
7	Absence of any	Balanced	One or more are outstanding but not in balance to core attributes	Overall plain flavour – mainly characterized by the core attributes and less by the complementary attributes
8	Absence of any	Well balanced with moderate base cacao flavour	One or more are outstanding, in balance to core attributes and to each other	Overall flavour presents some complexity
9	Absence of any	Well balanced, good base cacao flavour	Many outstanding, in balance to core attributes and to each other	Overall flavour presents a combination of complexity, uniqueness, harmony, brightness, clean finish
10	Absence of any	Well balanced, in low to moderate intensity, good base cacao flavour	Clearly recognizable, many outstanding, in balance to core attributes and to each other	Overall flavour presents a combination of complexity, uniqueness, harmony, brightness, clean finish
				quality, rarely seen

Origin: Region:



Annex 3. Cut Test References and Photos

3A. References

Cacao cut test chart (left) and cacao bean fissuring chart (right)



Reference: Sukha D & Rohsius C. 2004. Cocoa Cut Test Chart. Technical Guide. The University of Hamburg, Centre Klein Flottbek, The University of the West Indies, Cocoa Research Center, Hamburg and St. Augustine. 6 p.



Increasing degree of cacao bean fissuring from top left to bottom right (Bioversity International, Archila, 2022).

CoEx Sample Code: 000/23 Producer: Origin: Region:



3B. Overview of cut test





3C. Cut test photos of beans

	A-side	B -side	Results
1			Medium brown, Fissuring 3
2			Dark brown, Fissuring 3
3			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
4			Partly purple, Fissuring 2
5			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
6			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
7			Medium brown, Fissuring 4
8			Purple / violet, Fissuring 3
9			Medium brown, Fissuring 4
10			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
11			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
12			Medium brown, Fissuring 4
13			Dark brown, Fissuring 4
14			Light brown, Fissuring 2
15			Partly purple, Fissuring 3
16			Dark brown, Fissuring 4







35		Purple / violet, Fissuring 2
36		Dark brown, Fissuring 4
37		Dark brown, Fissuring 4
38		Medium brown, Fissuring 4
39		Medium brown, Fissuring 4
40		Purple / violet, Fissuring 2
41		Medium brown, Fissuring 2
42		Purple / violet, Fissuring 2
43		Partly purple, Fissuring 4
44		Medium brown, Fissuring 4
45	Carbo I	Medium brown, Fissuring 3
46		Medium brown, Fissuring 4
47		Medium brown, Fissuring 3
48		Medium brown, Fissuring 4
49		Dark brown, Fissuring 4
50		Medium brown, Fissuring 4











cacaoofexcellence.org